

405 A Examples of Explanations

406 In this section we present several human annotated natural language explanations and explanations
407 generated by the explanation generation model in the ELV framework in different datasets to better
408 understand the proposed approach.

409 A.1 TACRED

410 A.1.1 Human Annotated Explanations

411 a) *Although not a Playboy Playmate , she has appeared in nude pictorials with her Girls Next*
412 *Door costars and fellow Hefner girlfriends Holly Madison and Kendra Baskett(OBJ), then*
413 *known as Kendra Wilkinson(SUBJ).*

414 **Label:** per:alternate_names

415 **Explanation:** The term "then known as" occurs between SUBJ and OBJ and there are no
416 more than six words between SUBJ and OBJ

417 b) *Burke(SUBJ) 's mother Melissa Bell(OBJ) was a singer in the dance group Soul II Soul,*
418 *which had hits in the 1980s and 1990s.*

419 **Label:** per:parents

420 **Explanation:** SUBJ and OBJ sandwich the phrase "'s mother" and there are no more than
421 three words between SUBJ and OBJ

422 c) *Ellen Pompeo(OBJ) secretly married Chris Ivery(SUBJ) Congratulations to the newlyweds*
423 *and let them live happily ever after !!*

424 **Label:** per:spouse

425 **Explanation:** There are no more than four words between SUBJ and OBJ and SUBJ and
426 OBJ sandwich the phrase "secretly married"

427 A.1.2 Machine Generated Explanations

428 a) *Lomax shares a story about Almena Lomax, his mother and a newspaper owner and*
429 *journalist(OBJ) in Los Angeles , taking her(SUBJ) family on the bus to Tuskegee, Ala., in*
430 *1961.*

431 **Label:** per:title

432 **Explanation:** the word "family" is right after SUBJ.

433 b) *What happened to their investments was of no interest to them, because they would already be*
434 *paid , said Paul Hodgson(OBJ), senior research associate at the Corporate Library(SUBJ),*
435 *a shareholder activist group.*

436 **Label:** per:org:top_members/employees

437 **Explanation:** The word "senior research associate at" appears right before SUBJ.

438 c) *Iroquois passport dispute raises sovereignty issue The National Congress of American*
439 *Indians(SUBJ), based in Washington, DC(OBJ), has advocated on behalf of the lacrosse*
440 *team, urging British officials to allow the members entry into England on their Iroquois-*
441 *issued passports.*

442 **Label:** org:country_of_headquarterse

443 **Explanation:** The word "based in" appears right before OBJ.

444 A.2 SemEval

445 A.2.1 Human Annotated Explanations

446 a) *Morton's SUBJ-O is the most common cause of localized OBJ-O in the third interspace and*
447 *these diagnostic tests produce good indications of the condition.*

448 **Label:** Cause-Effect (e1, e2)

449 **Explanation:** Between SUBJ and OBJ the term "is the most common cause of" appears
450 and SUBJ precedes OBJ

- 451 b) *The frontal SUBJ-O is a part of the OBJ-O that maintains very close ties with the limbic*
 452 *system.*
 453 **Label:** Component-Whole(e1, e2)
 454 **Explanation:** Between SUBJ and OBJ the term "is a part of the" appears and SUBJ precedes
 455 OBJ.
- 456 c) *Out current Secretary is gathering SUBJ-O from past OBJ-O and committee chairs.*
 457 **Label:** Entity-Origin(e1, e2)
 458 **Explanation:** The phrase "from past" links SUBJ and OBJ and there are no more than three
 459 words between SUBJ and OBJ and OBJ follows SUBJ.

460 A.2.2 Machine Generated Explanations

- 461 a) *SUBJ-O caused OBJ-O at the Charlotte Douglas International Airport Monday morning.*
 462 **Label:** Cause-Effect(e1, e2)
 463 **Explanation:** There is only one word "caused" between subj and obj and obj follows subj.
- 464 b) *The base in which it sits hides the damage which occurred when the SUBJ-O was removed*
 465 *from its initial OBJ-O on the Long Tan battlefield.*
 466 **Label:** Entity-Origin(e1, e2)
 467 **Explanation:** Between subj and obj the phrase "was removed into" occurs and there are no
 468 more than four words between SUBJ and OBJ and SUBJ precedes OBJ
- 469 c) *A hinge SUBJ-O attaches a OBJ-O pivotally to a base of an electronic device and has a*
 470 *pivoting leaf and a stationary leaf.*
 471 **Label:** Component-Whole(e1, e2)
 472 **Explanation:** The phrase "attaches a" between SUBJ and OBJ and OBJ follows SUBJ

473 A.3 Restaurant

474 A.3.1 Human Annotated Explanations

- 475 a) *We had great desserts (including the best cannoli I've ever had) and then they offered an*
 476 *after dinner drink, on the house. (Term: cannoli)*
 477 **Label:** positive
 478 **Explanation:** The word "best" directly precedes the term.
- 479 b) *All the desserts the group tried got favorable reviews. (Term: desserts)*
 480 **Label:** positive
 481 **Explanation:** The string "favorable" appears no more than 5 words after the term.
- 482 c) *The most annoying thing, though, is the fact that the servers seem to be trained to drive*
 483 *revenue. (Term: servers)*
 484 **Label:** negative
 485 **Explanation:** The word "annoying" occurs before the term.

486 A.3.2 Machine Generated Explanations

- 487 a) *This little place is wonderfully warm welcoming. (Term: place)*
 488 **Label:** positive
 489 **Explanation:** The term is followed by "wonderful".
- 490 b) *The falafal was rather over cooked and dried but the chicken was fine. (Term: chicken)*
 491 **Label:** positive
 492 **Explanation:** The word "fine" occurs within 3 words after the term.
- 493 c) *Service was awful - mostly because staff were overwhelmed on a Saturday night. (Term:*
 494 *staff)*
 495 **Label:** negative
 496 **Explanation:** The word "unbearable" occurs within three words after the term.

Table 8: Results (Macro-F1) on ASC datasets in supervised setting with different fraction of labeled data used.

Fraction of labeled data used	60%	70%	80%	90%	100%
ELV (ours)	75.5	-	-	-	-
BERT-base	74.6	75.0	75.3	75.4	75.4

497 A.4 Laptop

498 A.4.1 Human Annotated Explanations

499 a) *The DVD drive randomly pops open when it is in my backpack as well, which is annoying.*
 500 *(Term: DVD drive)*

501 **Label:** negative

502 **Explanation:** The string "annoying" occurs after the term

503 b) *The Apple team also assists you very nicely when choosing which computer is right for you.*
 504 *(Term: Apple team)*

505 **Label:** positive

506 **Explanation:** The string "very nicely" occurs after the term by no more than 6 words.

507 c) *The design is awesome, quality is unprecedented. (Term: design)*

508 **Label:** positive

509 **Explanation:** The word "awesome" is within 2 words after the term.

510 A.4.2 Machine Generated Explanations

511 a) *I ordered my 2012 mac mini after being disappointed with spec of the new 27 Imacs. (Term:*
 512 *spec)*

513 **Label:** negative

514 **Explanation:** The word "disappointed" occurs within 3 words before the term.

515 b) *I found the mini to be exceptionally easy to set up. (Term: set up)*

516 **Label:** positive

517 **Explanation:** The phrase "exceptionally easy" occurs within 3 words before the term.

518 c) *However, there are MAJOR issues with the touchpad which render the device nearly useless.*
 519 *(Term: touchpad)*

520 **Label:** negative

521 **Explanation:** The phrase "nearly useless" occurs within 3 words after the term.

522 B Human Evaluation Details

523 For human evaluation, we random sample 100 examples in the test set of the Restaurant dataset and
 524 use ELV to predict the labels of the selected examples. Then we use different compared models
 525 to generate explanations of the prediction results with both the input sentences and the predicted
 526 labels. Afterward, we invite 5 graduate students with English proficiency to score the explanations.
 527 The annotation scenarios include the explanantions' informativeness(Info.), correctness (Corr.), and
 528 consistency (Cons.) with respect to the model prediction. Specifically, the informativeness measures
 529 to what extent the generated explanation is helpful to understand the model's prediction output. The
 530 correctness measures whether the explanation is factually correct (e.g. word "good" before the terms
 531 leads to positive label while word "annoying" is negative). The consistency refers to whether the
 532 explanation is consistent with the input sentence (i.e. the description in the explanation is true w.r.t
 533 the input sentence).

534 **C Addition Analysis Experiments**

535 In this section, we report additional experimental results comparing the performance of ELV with
536 60% of labeled data and the performance with the BERT-base model with 60%, 70%, 80%, 90%, and
537 100% of labeled data to investigate to what extent human annotated explanations can replace human
538 labeled examples. The result is shown in Table 8. We find that ELV can achieve or even exceed the
539 performance of a BERT-base model trained with much more labeled data. This confirms that ELV
540 can effectively leverage human annotated explanations as additional information.