

Appendix

Algorithm. The pseudocode formulation of the proposed GIL algorithm is given in Algorithm 1. We note that the presentation of the algorithm is independent of the specific MDP model used. Our specific formulation of an MDP model of the Maximal Independent Set (mIS) problem is given in Section 4.1.

Extended Results. We show an extended version of the results in Table 2, in which reported values are separated by the number of players n . We also include an additional analysis that evaluates the win rate percentage for each of the methods instead of average reward, since the average reward metric may be sensitive to outliers (i.e., game instances with abnormally large or small objective function values). This is shown in Table 3, with ties being broken randomly in case there is more than one winner. The full results of hyperparameter optimization are too expansive to report directly as tables, and have been included in the supplementary material in the `mcts_hyps.csv` and `il_hyps.csv` files for UCT and GIL respectively. For SA, the lowest tested value $\epsilon = 10$ of the simulated annealing rate was optimal across all settings tested (we did not explore lower values since the method would become significantly more expensive to run, and is already slow as shown in Figure 6).

Implementation. Our implementation is available at <https://github.com/VictorDarvariu/solving-graph-pgg> as Docker containers together with instructions that enable reproducing (up to hardware differences) all the results reported in the paper, including tables and figures. For complete instructions to reproduce the results, please consult the `README.md` file in the repository. We implement all approaches and baselines in Python using a variety of numerical and scientific computing packages [27, 25, 40, 43, 50]. For GIL, we use the PyTorch implementation of *structure2vec* provided by the original authors [14].

Data Availability. The provided implementation contains the necessary code and instructions to generate the synthetic data on which the experiments are carried out. Please consult the `README.md` file in the root of the repository.

Infrastructure and Runtimes. Experiments were carried out on an internal cluster of 8 machines, each equipped with 2 Intel Xeon E5-2630 v3 processors and 128GB RAM. On this infrastructure, the experiments reported in this paper took approximately 14 days to complete.

Algorithm 1 Graph Imitation Learning (GIL).

```

1: procedure GIL( $\mathbf{G}^{train}, \mathbf{G}^{eval}$ )
2:    $\Theta = \text{INITPARAMS}()$  ▷ Randomly initialize policy  $\hat{\pi}$  and underlying GNN.
3:    $\mathcal{D} = \text{COLLECTDATASET}(\mathbf{G}^{train})$ 
4:   while true do
5:      $b = \text{SAMPLEBATCH}(\mathcal{D})$ 
6:     update  $\Theta$  by  $\text{SGD}(b, \mathcal{L})$  ▷ See Equation 2 for loss term.
7:      $\text{CHECKSTOPPINGCRITERION}(\hat{\pi}, \mathbf{G}^{eval})$  ▷ Validate performance on held-out set.
8:   return policy  $\hat{\pi}$ 

9: procedure COLLECTDATASET( $\mathbf{G}^{train}$ )
10:  for  $G$  in  $\mathbf{G}^{train}$  do
11:     $S_0 = \text{INITSTATE}(G)$ 
12:    while  $|\mathcal{A}(S_t)| > 0$  do
13:       $d = \text{RUNMCTS}(S_t)$  ▷ Collect a demonstration by MCTS policy  $\pi$ .
14:       $\mathcal{D} = \mathcal{D} \cup \{d\}$  ▷ Add demonstration to dataset.
15:       $A_t = \text{ROBUSTCHILD}(d)$ 
16:       $S_{t+1} = \mathcal{P}(S_t, A_t)$  ▷ Apply deterministic transition model.
17:       $t+ = 1$ 
18:  return  $\mathcal{D}$ 

19: procedure RUNMCTS( $S$ )
20:  create root node  $v$  from  $S$ 
21:  for  $i = 0$  to  $n_{sims}$  do
22:     $v_l = \text{TREEPOLICY}(v)$ 
23:     $R = \text{RANDOMDEFAULTPOLICY}(v_l)$ 
24:     $\text{BACKUP}(v_l, R)$  ▷ Backup reward (proportional to objective  $f$ ).
25:   $\mathbf{v} = []$ 
26:  for  $a$  in  $\mathcal{A}(S)$  do ▷ Construct vector of visit counts for all actions.
27:     $\mathbf{v}.\text{append}(C(S, a))$ 
28:  return  $(S, \mathcal{A}(S), n, \mathbf{v})$ 

```

Table 2: Mean rewards obtained by the methods split by cost setting, graph model, objective function, and number of players.

c	G	f	n	Rand	TH	TLC	BR	PT	SA	UCT	GIL (ours)
HC	BA	F	15	0.757 \pm 0.005	0.814	0.785	0.753 \pm 0.006	0.797 \pm 0.016	0.825 \pm 0.001	0.848 \pm 0.000	0.845 \pm 0.001
			25	0.750 \pm 0.005	0.806	0.774	0.747 \pm 0.007	0.794 \pm 0.017	0.820 \pm 0.002	0.842 \pm 0.000	0.839 \pm 0.000
			50	0.742 \pm 0.007	0.797	0.773	0.741 \pm 0.005	0.788 \pm 0.016	0.811 \pm 0.001	0.835 \pm 0.000	0.832 \pm 0.001
			75	0.741 \pm 0.006	0.797	0.772	0.736 \pm 0.004	0.789 \pm 0.014	0.810 \pm 0.001	0.831 \pm 0.000	0.828 \pm 0.002
		SW	100	0.737 \pm 0.005	0.796	0.767	0.732 \pm 0.004	0.787 \pm 0.012	0.808 \pm 0.001	0.829 \pm 0.000	0.826 \pm 0.001
			15	0.708 \pm 0.007	0.793	0.738	0.702 \pm 0.009	0.763 \pm 0.020	0.806 \pm 0.001	0.827 \pm 0.000	0.825 \pm 0.000
			25	0.702 \pm 0.008	0.782	0.728	0.698 \pm 0.011	0.762 \pm 0.023	0.801 \pm 0.002	0.820 \pm 0.000	0.819 \pm 0.000
			50	0.694 \pm 0.010	0.774	0.726	0.691 \pm 0.007	0.756 \pm 0.021	0.791 \pm 0.001	0.813 \pm 0.000	0.811 \pm 0.000
			75	0.692 \pm 0.009	0.774	0.726	0.684 \pm 0.007	0.759 \pm 0.018	0.790 \pm 0.001	0.809 \pm 0.000	0.806 \pm 0.001
		ER	100	0.688 \pm 0.008	0.774	0.720	0.680 \pm 0.007	0.757 \pm 0.016	0.788 \pm 0.001	0.807 \pm 0.001	0.804 \pm 0.001
			15	0.806 \pm 0.004	0.839	0.861	0.807 \pm 0.002	0.839 \pm 0.007	0.849 \pm 0.002	0.895 \pm 0.000	0.892 \pm 0.001
			25	0.841 \pm 0.002	0.865	0.889	0.840 \pm 0.001	0.881 \pm 0.004	0.879 \pm 0.002	0.925 \pm 0.000	0.920 \pm 0.001
			50	0.893 \pm 0.001	0.909	0.934	0.892 \pm 0.001	0.930 \pm 0.001	0.924 \pm 0.001	0.958 \pm 0.000	0.954 \pm 0.000
	WS	F	75	0.916 \pm 0.001	0.928	0.953	0.915 \pm 0.001	0.946 \pm 0.001	0.940 \pm 0.000	0.970 \pm 0.000	0.965 \pm 0.006
			100	0.930 \pm 0.001	0.940	0.962	0.930 \pm 0.001	0.957 \pm 0.001	0.951 \pm 0.001	0.977 \pm 0.000	0.969 \pm 0.011
			15	0.782 \pm 0.004	0.823	0.841	0.782 \pm 0.001	0.820 \pm 0.008	0.836 \pm 0.002	0.882 \pm 0.000	0.878 \pm 0.001
			25	0.829 \pm 0.002	0.856	0.877	0.827 \pm 0.001	0.871 \pm 0.005	0.872 \pm 0.002	0.918 \pm 0.000	0.912 \pm 0.000
		SW	50	0.887 \pm 0.001	0.905	0.931	0.887 \pm 0.001	0.927 \pm 0.002	0.921 \pm 0.001	0.956 \pm 0.000	0.948 \pm 0.002
			75	0.913 \pm 0.001	0.925	0.951	0.912 \pm 0.001	0.944 \pm 0.001	0.938 \pm 0.000	0.969 \pm 0.000	0.965 \pm 0.001
			100	0.928 \pm 0.001	0.939	0.960	0.928 \pm 0.001	0.955 \pm 0.001	0.950 \pm 0.001	0.976 \pm 0.000	0.971 \pm 0.002
		F	15	0.818 \pm 0.007	0.817	0.868	0.814 \pm 0.005	0.833 \pm 0.007	0.848 \pm 0.006	0.904 \pm 0.002	0.903 \pm 0.000
			25	0.799 \pm 0.006	0.807	0.867	0.801 \pm 0.004	0.817 \pm 0.006	0.828 \pm 0.003	0.891 \pm 0.000	0.890 \pm 0.000
			50	0.801 \pm 0.002	0.805	0.864	0.801 \pm 0.003	0.819 \pm 0.005	0.830 \pm 0.001	0.890 \pm 0.000	0.890 \pm 0.000
			75	0.799 \pm 0.002	0.800	0.862	0.801 \pm 0.003	0.818 \pm 0.003	0.827 \pm 0.001	0.886 \pm 0.000	0.886 \pm 0.000
	IC	SW	100	0.800 \pm 0.001	0.802	0.863	0.801 \pm 0.002	0.818 \pm 0.004	0.828 \pm 0.001	0.887 \pm 0.000	0.888 \pm 0.000
			15	0.795 \pm 0.009	0.797	0.850	0.790 \pm 0.006	0.811 \pm 0.008	0.832 \pm 0.008	0.889 \pm 0.002	0.888 \pm 0.000
			25	0.775 \pm 0.008	0.784	0.847	0.779 \pm 0.005	0.797 \pm 0.007	0.812 \pm 0.003	0.875 \pm 0.000	0.873 \pm 0.001
			50	0.778 \pm 0.003	0.784	0.845	0.780 \pm 0.005	0.799 \pm 0.005	0.815 \pm 0.001	0.876 \pm 0.000	0.875 \pm 0.000
		F	75	0.777 \pm 0.002	0.779	0.843	0.780 \pm 0.003	0.798 \pm 0.003	0.812 \pm 0.001	0.871 \pm 0.000	0.871 \pm 0.000
			100	0.778 \pm 0.001	0.781	0.844	0.780 \pm 0.003	0.798 \pm 0.004	0.813 \pm 0.001	0.871 \pm 0.000	0.872 \pm 0.000
		BA	15	0.837 \pm 0.001	0.851	—	0.837 \pm 0.001	0.846 \pm 0.005	0.855 \pm 0.000	0.855 \pm 0.000	0.855 \pm 0.000
			25	0.835 \pm 0.001	0.845	—	0.835 \pm 0.000	0.844 \pm 0.006	0.851 \pm 0.000	0.852 \pm 0.000	0.850 \pm 0.000
			50	0.832 \pm 0.000	0.842	—	0.832 \pm 0.000	0.840 \pm 0.006	0.848 \pm 0.000	0.846 \pm 0.000	0.845 \pm 0.001
			75	0.832 \pm 0.001	0.841	—	0.832 \pm 0.001	0.839 \pm 0.005	0.846 \pm 0.000	0.843 \pm 0.000	0.843 \pm 0.001
	ER	SW	100	0.831 \pm 0.001	0.840	—	0.832 \pm 0.001	0.838 \pm 0.004	0.844 \pm 0.000	0.840 \pm 0.000	0.842 \pm 0.001
			15	0.710 \pm 0.008	0.794	—	0.703 \pm 0.010	0.760 \pm 0.021	0.805 \pm 0.001	0.807 \pm 0.000	0.807 \pm 0.000
			25	0.702 \pm 0.009	0.779	—	0.698 \pm 0.010	0.759 \pm 0.023	0.799 \pm 0.001	0.800 \pm 0.000	0.800 \pm 0.000
			50	0.695 \pm 0.008	0.776	—	0.692 \pm 0.007	0.756 \pm 0.020	0.792 \pm 0.001	0.793 \pm 0.000	0.793 \pm 0.001
		F	75	0.689 \pm 0.009	0.774	—	0.682 \pm 0.006	0.756 \pm 0.017	0.789 \pm 0.001	0.790 \pm 0.000	0.790 \pm 0.001
			100	0.687 \pm 0.008	0.772	—	0.679 \pm 0.006	0.755 \pm 0.016	0.785 \pm 0.001	0.786 \pm 0.000	0.786 \pm 0.001
			15	0.844 \pm 0.001	0.860	—	0.844 \pm 0.001	0.855 \pm 0.003	0.868 \pm 0.001	0.873 \pm 0.000	0.872 \pm 0.000
			25	0.865 \pm 0.001	0.880	—	0.864 \pm 0.001	0.881 \pm 0.001	0.892 \pm 0.001	0.899 \pm 0.000	0.898 \pm 0.001
		SW	50	0.901 \pm 0.001	0.916	—	0.900 \pm 0.001	0.918 \pm 0.000	0.927 \pm 0.000	0.932 \pm 0.000	0.931 \pm 0.000
			75	0.921 \pm 0.000	0.931	—	0.921 \pm 0.000	0.935 \pm 0.000	0.943 \pm 0.000	0.948 \pm 0.000	0.943 \pm 0.006
			100	0.934 \pm 0.001	0.943	—	0.934 \pm 0.001	0.945 \pm 0.000	0.953 \pm 0.000	0.957 \pm 0.000	0.951 \pm 0.006
	WS	F	15	0.780 \pm 0.002	0.818	—	0.777 \pm 0.002	0.807 \pm 0.007	0.834 \pm 0.001	0.843 \pm 0.000	0.841 \pm 0.000
			25	0.829 \pm 0.002	0.855	—	0.827 \pm 0.001	0.856 \pm 0.002	0.873 \pm 0.001	0.884 \pm 0.000	0.882 \pm 0.001
			50	0.886 \pm 0.001	0.906	—	0.885 \pm 0.001	0.909 \pm 0.001	0.920 \pm 0.000	0.926 \pm 0.000	0.922 \pm 0.002
			75	0.912 \pm 0.001	0.925	—	0.912 \pm 0.001	0.930 \pm 0.000	0.939 \pm 0.000	0.944 \pm 0.000	0.942 \pm 0.002
		SW	100	0.928 \pm 0.001	0.939	—	0.928 \pm 0.001	0.942 \pm 0.000	0.950 \pm 0.000	0.954 \pm 0.000	0.951 \pm 0.004
			15	0.843 \pm 0.003	0.844	—	0.841 \pm 0.003	0.846 \pm 0.003	0.856 \pm 0.002	0.864 \pm 0.001	0.865 \pm 0.001
			25	0.841 \pm 0.001	0.843	—	0.843 \pm 0.002	0.848 \pm 0.002	0.856 \pm 0.001	0.861 \pm 0.000	0.863 \pm 0.000
			50	0.841 \pm 0.001	0.843	—	0.842 \pm 0.002	0.846 \pm 0.002	0.856 \pm 0.000	0.861 \pm 0.000	0.864 \pm 0.000
		F	75	0.841 \pm 0.000	0.842	—	0.842 \pm 0.001	0.847 \pm 0.001	0.856 \pm 0.000	0.861 \pm 0.000	0.864 \pm 0.000
			100	0.842 \pm 0.001	0.843	—	0.842 \pm 0.001	0.846 \pm 0.001	0.856 \pm 0.000	0.860 \pm 0.000	0.864 \pm 0.000
		SW	15	0.779 \pm 0.007	0.783	—	0.774 \pm 0.007	0.790 \pm 0.007	0.812 \pm 0.004	0.829 \pm 0.001	0.828 \pm 0.002
			25	0.775 \pm 0.006	0.781	—	0.782 \pm 0.006	0.794 \pm 0.006	0.812 \pm 0.002	0.823 \pm 0.000	0.826 \pm 0.000
			50	0.777 \pm 0.003	0.782	—	0.778 \pm 0.005	0.791 \pm 0.005	0.813 \pm 0.001	0.824 \pm 0.000	0.829 \pm 0.001
			75	0.777 \pm 0.001	0.780	—	0.780 \pm 0.003	0.792 \pm 0.003	0.812 \pm 0.001	0.822 \pm 0.000	0.828 \pm 0.001
			100	0.778 \pm 0.002	0.781	—	0.779 \pm 0.003	0.791 \pm 0.003	0.812 \pm 0.000	0.821 \pm 0.000	0.828 \pm 0.000

Table 3: Win rates (%) for the different methods.

c	G	f	n	Rand	TH	TLC	BR	PT	SA	UCT	GIL (ours)
HC	BA	F	15	1.800	1.000	0.400	0.900	17.100	9.300	43.100	26.400
			25	0.400	0.300	0.400	0.100	20.200	5.000	47.900	25.700
			50	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	12.900	2.300	62.800	22.000
			75	0.000	0.000	0.100	0.000	13.400	0.800	66.400	19.300
			100	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	11.200	0.700	73.800	14.300
			15	1.800	0.700	0.400	0.900	18.400	12.000	39.500	26.300
			25	0.300	0.100	0.400	0.300	20.600	8.900	41.500	27.900
			50	0.100	0.000	0.000	0.000	14.900	3.600	60.800	20.600
			75	0.100	0.100	0.100	0.000	15.400	2.200	62.600	19.500
			100	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	13.000	2.000	68.400	16.600
		SW	15	0.900	0.100	1.100	0.900	7.700	5.200	54.600	29.500
			25	0.300	0.000	0.200	0.100	5.000	2.400	64.800	27.200
			50	0.000	0.000	0.600	0.000	3.100	0.900	65.500	29.900
			75	0.000	0.000	0.600	0.000	1.700	0.200	64.400	33.100
			100	0.000	0.000	0.300	0.000	1.200	0.400	67.800	30.300
	ER	F	15	0.800	0.200	1.100	0.600	7.300	5.700	53.800	30.500
			25	0.200	0.100	0.500	0.100	4.900	2.400	60.600	31.200
			50	0.000	0.000	0.800	0.000	2.700	1.500	74.800	20.200
			75	0.000	0.000	0.500	0.000	1.700	0.100	69.000	28.700
		SW	100	0.000	0.000	0.200	0.000	1.400	0.000	73.500	24.900
			15	0.300	0.000	0.800	0.200	0.700	3.100	58.200	36.700
			25	0.000	0.000	0.600	0.000	0.500	0.500	57.200	41.200
			50	0.000	0.000	0.100	0.000	0.000	0.000	55.700	44.200
			75	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	50.700	49.300
			100	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	43.700	56.300
			15	0.600	0.000	0.700	0.300	0.900	3.100	55.800	38.600
			25	0.000	0.000	0.500	0.000	0.400	1.200	61.600	36.300
			50	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	60.600	39.400
			75	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	49.800	50.200
			100	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	47.200	52.800
	WS	F	15	0.300	0.000	0.800	0.200	0.700	3.100	58.200	36.700
			25	0.000	0.000	0.600	0.000	0.500	0.500	57.200	41.200
			50	0.000	0.000	0.100	0.000	0.000	0.000	55.700	44.200
			75	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	50.700	49.300
			100	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	43.700	56.300
		SW	15	0.600	0.000	0.700	0.300	0.900	3.100	55.800	38.600
			25	0.000	0.000	0.500	0.000	0.400	1.200	61.600	36.300
			50	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	60.600	39.400
			75	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	49.800	50.200
			100	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	47.200	52.800
			15	0.600	0.000	0.700	0.300	0.900	3.100	55.800	38.600
			25	0.000	0.000	0.500	0.000	0.400	1.200	61.600	36.300
			50	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	60.600	39.400
			75	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	49.800	50.200
			100	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	47.200	52.800
	IC	BA	15	4.500	1.400	—	3.100	18.200	24.700	25.100	23.000
			25	2.100	0.400	—	2.200	22.800	22.900	31.700	17.900
			50	0.400	1.200	—	0.600	21.400	34.000	25.400	17.000
			75	0.200	0.800	—	0.300	20.300	40.200	20.500	17.700
			100	0.000	0.100	—	0.100	21.700	48.200	14.900	15.000
		SW	15	1.900	1.800	—	1.600	19.200	24.200	25.600	25.700
			25	0.600	0.900	—	0.400	22.800	24.600	27.200	23.500
			50	0.100	0.600	—	0.000	21.200	24.300	27.600	26.200
			75	0.000	0.300	—	0.000	20.200	25.800	25.100	28.600
			100	0.000	0.000	—	0.000	21.500	24.500	25.300	28.700
		ER	15	2.300	1.000	—	2.400	9.600	20.300	35.300	29.100
			25	0.600	0.300	—	0.000	6.800	19.200	39.600	33.500
			50	0.000	0.100	—	0.000	1.900	17.000	43.600	37.400
			75	0.000	0.100	—	0.000	1.500	15.000	57.200	26.200
			100	0.000	0.100	—	0.000	0.500	14.000	55.700	29.700
		SW	15	2.300	0.800	—	1.700	10.000	19.600	35.100	30.500
			25	0.800	0.500	—	0.300	7.500	18.700	42.100	30.100
			50	0.200	0.400	—	0.100	3.800	18.500	49.000	28.000
			75	0.000	0.200	—	0.000	1.200	12.600	49.600	36.400
			100	0.000	0.100	—	0.000	0.700	13.100	54.400	31.700
	WS	F	15	1.200	0.000	—	0.200	1.500	12.800	37.500	46.800
			25	0.200	0.000	—	1.200	2.500	14.800	36.200	45.100
			50	0.000	0.000	—	0.000	0.100	3.700	27.200	69.000
			75	0.000	0.000	—	0.000	0.000	1.300	18.400	80.300
			100	0.000	0.000	—	0.000	0.000	0.400	9.700	89.900
		SW	15	0.700	0.100	—	1.000	2.300	15.400	41.400	39.100
			25	0.000	0.100	—	1.100	2.000	13.200	34.900	48.700
			50	0.000	0.000	—	0.000	0.100	2.800	27.200	69.900
			75	0.000	0.000	—	0.000	0.000	1.600	19.000	79.400
			100	0.000	0.000	—	0.000	0.000	0.600	12.000	87.400